

The State of Proactive Disclosure of Information in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Punjab Public Bodies

August 10, 2015

Contents

Executive Summary:.....	1
Proactive Disclosure Regional Report: Punjab and Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa	3
Introduction:.....	3
Acknowledgments:	5
Methodology:.....	6
Scoresheet criteria for Punjab province:	6
Scoresheet criteria for Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa province:	6
Proactive Disclosure – Province of Punjab.....	8
Sample Website 1: Government of Punjab	8
Sample Website 2: Citizen Feedback Model	8
Sample Website 3: Office of the Chief Minister.....	9
Sample Website 4: Finance Department.....	9
Sample Website 5: Punjab Revenue Authority	10
Sample Website 6: Excise and Taxation.....	10
Sample Website 7: Planning and Development Department Punjab Revenue Authority.....	11
Sample Website 8: Higher Education Department and School Education Department	11
Sample Website 9: Schools.....	12
Sample Website 10: Zakat and Ushr.....	12
Sample Website 11: Social Welfare and Bair-ul-Maal	13
Sample Website 12: Women Development Department	13
Sample Website 13: Punjab Energy Department.....	14
Sample Website 14: Health Department.....	14
Sample Website 15: Punjab Privatization Board	15
Sample Website 16: Punjab Information Technology Board	15
Sample Website 17: Sports Board Punjab	16
Sample Website 18: Punjab Information Commission	16
Sample Website 19: Information and Culture.....	17
Proactive Disclosure – Province of Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa.....	18
Sample Website 1: Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa	18
Sample Website 2: Finance Department.....	18
Sample Website 3: Accountant General of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa	19
Sample Website 4: Finance and Planning Department – District Abbottabad	19

Sample Website 5: Elementary and Secondary Education Department Website	20
Sample Website 6: Social Welfare, Special Education & Women Empowerment Department.....	20
Sample Website 7: Information & Public Relations Department	21
Sample Website 8: Police Department.....	21
Sample Website 9: Health Department.....	22
Sample Website 10: - Province Housing Authority.....	22
Sample Website 11: KPK Information Technology Board.....	23
Sample Website 12: Investment Promotion Cell	23
Sample Website 13: Right to Information Commission Khyber Pakhtunkhwa.....	24
Recommendations:.....	25

Executive Summary:

Public bodies of provinces of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Punjab are required to proactively disclose categories of information mentioned in Sections 5 and 4 of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Right to Information Act 2013 and Punjab Transparency and Right to Information Act 2013, respectively. State of Proactive Disclosure of Information in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Punjab Public Bodies' report is an initiative of Coalition of Right to Information (CRTI) as a step toward creating a scale measuring as to what extent public bodies are actually following their respective RTI laws.

Punjab and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa public bodies are legally bound to proactively share information pertaining to particulars of the public body, its functions and duties, powers and functions of its officers and employees, norms and criteria set by the public body for the discharge of its functions, Acts, Ordinances, Rules, Regulations, Notifications, Circulars and other legal instruments being enforced, issued or used by the public body in the discharge of its functions, a statement of categories of information being held by the public body, a description of its decision-making processes and any opportunities for the public to provide input into or be consulted about decisions, a directory of its officers and employees with their respective remuneration, perks and privileges, budget of the public body including details of all proposed and actual expenditures, amount of subsidy and details of beneficiaries if the public body provides any subsidy, particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits or authorizations granted by the public body, facilities available with the public body for obtaining information held by it, name, designation and other particulars of the public information officer of the public body.

This bi-annual report covers first six months of 2015 in its survey of public bodies of Khyber Pkhtunkhwa and Punjab in line with proactive disclosure provisions of their respective laws. Conspicuously absent from the web domain is Punjab Information Department violating all provisions of Section 4 of the Punjab Transparency and Right to Information Act 2013. In clear violation of right to information laws, all most all of the surveyed public bodies fail to provide information about particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits or authorizations granted by the public bodies. This clearly suggests that public bodies do not want to be transparent and accountable to citizens. This furthers the narrative of earlier reports that even though it is a positive effort to legislate RTI laws meeting international standards, citizens will only benefit when the respective provincial commissions play their due role in implementing those laws. Public bodies have started sharing information about the budget but almost all the surveyed public bodies failed to provide proposed and the actual expenditure. Public bodies also failed to provide information about remunerations, salaries, benefits, and any other such payments the respective departments provide to their employed staff or beneficiaries.

Some of the public bodies in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa have started sharing information about Public Information Officer to seek information from under KP right to information law but none of the surveyed public body in Punjab has shared details about the designated Public Information Officer.

Interestingly, Punjab Information Commission web site contains list of Public Information Officers designated by public bodies but there is no information about the Public Information Officer designated by the commission.

Whilst working on this research report during the first half of 2015, various loopholes were identified in both the site maintenance and the lack of useful content in the websites of public departments. However, first report of 2015 indicates some positive steps being taken by different departments as a larger number of websites were found updated with useful content. There was also quite a few websites of both the provinces that have been redesigned since the last quarterly report of 2014 was published. Redesigned websites have a better loading time and have also been designed with better user interface presenting the information to the public in a more convenient way which should be applauded.

Proactive disclosure is the only way forward to transparent governance and reduced corruption in the public bodies. Here is list of recommendations forwarded by CRTI and DRF; we look forward to suggestions and input from both the civil society and the government.

- According to respective RTI laws of both the provinces, government departments have to proactively share information of tenders and projects. While many websites were found updated with latest content, a majority of them lacked proper updating process with a substantial lack of budget-related information.
- It was recommended in the 2014 reports that departments should focus on user-friendly placement of content and get rid of highly confusing nested menus where most of the useful information is hidden. CRTI and DRF is happy to share that many of the website have followed this suggestion as various government websites now have a new website layout, presenting information in a very convenient way.
- A major concern of government departments unwilling to share RTI-related information still holds true as we have moved forward from 2014 to 2015. Apart from regular news and updates, with the enhancement of RTI laws, state departments should revise their web content and identify if they are even following these laws. As put in our methodology, Proactive Disclosure Research report has put forward some concrete, easy-to-follow steps to help departments identify where they are falling behind with regards to RTI laws. This year too, we see a failure of departments to upload related content but it is a great hope that like website readability, RTI-related content will also be shared more proactively in the coming months.

Proactive Disclosure Regional Report: Punjab and Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa

Introduction:

Proactive Disclosure report is a research-based report to reflect the measures taken by various public bodies of Punjab and Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa in conforming to RTI laws. Under the respective Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa Right to Information Act 2013, and Punjab Transparency and Right to Information (RTI) Act 2013, this report intends to show the reader results of to what extent government bodies are disclosing required information on self-basis and on requests of a citizen among other various criteria.

In this report, research has been conducted on categorical basis covering up websites of all the major departments of both the aforementioned provinces. Proactive Disclosure Regional report aims to capture the environment of governmental bodies through a set of questions taken from the respective laws of the provinces.

Proactive Disclosure report intends to help identify the governmental departments and ministries openly sharing information with public as per required by the laws. It also helps to identify websites lacking such measures. This report has a potential to help different governmental bodies enhance their websites by sharing relevant information and making their online sites easily accessible and readable by a citizen. The report, thus, is a quarterly trying to measure any developments that happen to better mirror.

The ratings and scorecards included in this study particularly focus on developments and assessments that took place between the first half of 2015, i.e. January 2015 to June 2015.

Based on the report of this ongoing series, it has been discovered that while some departments keep their respective websites properly maintained and updated; many of the public bodies do not. This year, Information and Public Relations Department KP-K (www.infokhyberpakhtunkhwa.gov.pk) and Punjab Information Commission (www.rti.punjab.gov.pk) join the two departments, Higher Education and Schools Education departments (hed.punjab.gov.pk and schools.punjab.gov.pk, respectively), that had come in the top of the list for proactively disclosing information following the Right to Information laws of their respective provinces in 2014. Information Department KP-K has a dedicated space for RTI information on its website like the rest which were shared in the previous report.

One specific feature that must be applauded here is the inclusion of remuneration and perks and privileges of officers. Only two officers' details are mentioned, but it is a very positive sign toward more proactive disclosure of similar information. As previous report highlighted, the other two websites also have a dedicated space for information related to RTI laws disclosing governing laws and regulations, services provided to citizens, biographical information of employees, budget, and details for the projects and initiatives. While the information disclosed doesn't fulfil all the criteria of RTI laws, it is a positive sign of reinforcing laws and bringing transparency in the governance process.

The highlight of this year though is the website of Punjab Information Commission which becomes one of the first public bodies to share not only the details of its departmental budget but also the salaries and perks of its employees. Information Commission Punjab's website also leads the way to proactively disclose information by clearly outlining the steps using which RTI requests can be filed and the several stages through which these requests go through before a decision is made. A very good examples for the

rest of departments, it is expected that Punjab Information Commission would now take the lead to implement online web forms to help citizens easily file for RTI requests and work on the parameters, it's lacking.

Acknowledgments:

Coalition of Right to Information (CRTI):

Proactive Disclosure report has been commissioned by the Coalition of Right to Information (CRTI) which Digital Rights Foundation is an active member of. Established in December, 2012, CRTI is a group of civil society organizations with a primary goal to promote open information and communications policies. The coalition policy for better implementation of Right to Information laws in Pakistan following the international best practices of RTI legislations.

CRTI seeks to promote open information and communications policies at the federal, provincial and district levels across Pakistan. With various initiatives, the coalition of civil society organizations aims to promote citizen awareness and improve dialogue between the citizens and state.

CRTI also intends to promote transparency and accountability of public offices while strengthening a pluralist and development-centered democracy. The strong group of various organizations is focused to facilitating processes, tools, and technique to ensure the proper implementation of a user-friendly right to information regime in the country.

Digital Rights Foundation (DRF):

Digital Rights Foundation Pakistan is a research based advocacy organization based in the region focusing on ICTs to support human rights, democratic processes, and better digital governance. DRF opposes any and all sorts of online censorship and violations of human rights both on ground and online. Digital Rights Foundation works extensively to promote freedom of speech and open access to online content as they are deemed critically important for the development of socio-economy of the country.

Methodology:

Proactive Disclosure Research Report measures the openness of governmental websites using various points from the respective laws of the provinces along with a question to measure the ease of accessibility and readability.

Each individual question is scored on varying range of points to further help the report better reflect the degree of sharing and openness over the time. Each question is scored from a numerical range of 0 to 10, where 0 equates “doesn’t meet the provision”, and 10 equates “completely follows the provision”. The numerical scale is further divided in subsets of three: the first range **0 -3** represents “no or very low following of the provision; the second range **4- 7** shows “medium level of representation”; while the last **8 – 10** range shows a very good or maximum level of meeting the criteria taken from either the RTI Acts or used as an additional to further assess the website.

Scoresheet criteria for Punjab province:

Here is the checklist used to score the websites falling under Punjab province. Questions **(a)** through **(i)** used in the scoresheet are based on Punjab Transparency and RTI Act 2013; whereas questions **k** and **l** are used to assess the ease of accessibility of the websites and the option for citizens to file requests online, respectively.

- a. Information of public body, its functions and duties
- b. Directory of its officers and employees with their respective remuneration, perks and privileges
- c. Budget of the public body including details of all proposed and actual expenditures
- d. Statement of categories of information being held by the public body
- e. Acts, Ordinances, rules, regulations, notifications, circulars and other legal instruments being enforced, issued or used by the public body
- f. Particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits or authorizations granted by the public body
- g. Ease of accessibility of the information presented on self-basis
- h. Option for a citizen to ask for required information i.e. filing requests

Scoresheet criteria for Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa province:

For the Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa region, websites are assessed on the basis of several provisions taken from the Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa Right to Information Act 2013. For this province, provisions **a** to **j** are the actual points of RTI Act; whereas **k** is used for this report to better assess the ease of accessibility of the information presented on the websites on self-basis. Here is the checklist used for the websites of various ministries and departments of KPK government:

- a. Information about the public body, including its organization, functions, duties, powers and any services it provides to the public
- b. Directory of its officers and employees with their respective remuneration, perks, and privileges
- c. Detailed budget of the public body, including proposed and actual expenditures

- d. Powers and functions of its officers and employees
- e. Description of its decision-making processes
- f. Opportunities for the public to provide input into or be consulted about decisions
- g. Categories of information being held by the public body
- h. Acts, Ordinances, rules, regulations, notifications, circulars and other legal instruments being enforced, issued or used by the public body
- i. Particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits or authorizations granted by the public body
- j. Description of the manner in which requests for information may be made to the public body, including the name, title and contact details of all designated officers
- k. Ease of accessibility of the information presented on self-basis

The results of this Proactive Disclosure Research report are shown in a comprehensive and concise **RTI scoresheet** for quick and easy readability. Several criteria, taken from the respective aforementioned legislations, have been taken into consideration to measure the extent to which the websites sampled have proactively disclosed and shared information.

Proactive Disclosure – Province of Punjab

Criteria (a) through (i) based on Punjab Transparency and RTI Act 2013

Sample Website 1: Government of Punjab

Website link: www.punjab.gov.pk

Proactive Disclosure RTI Scoresheet – Punjab		
a. Information of public body, its functions and duties	0	
b. Directory of its officers and employees with their respective remuneration, perks and privileges	0	
c. Budget of the public body including details of all proposed and actual expenditures	4	<i>New budget not uploaded on the site</i>
d. Powers and functions of its officers and employees	2	
e. Description of its decision-making processes	0	
f. Opportunities for the public to provide input into or be consulted about decisions	0	
g. Statement of categories of information being held by the public body	0	
h. Acts, Ordinances, rules, regulations, notifications, circulars and other legal instruments being enforced, issued or used by the public body	5	
i. Particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits or authorizations granted by the public body	0	
j. Ease of accessibility of the information presented on self-basis	5	
k. Details pertaining to filing of Information Request, Like name, designation and other particulars of the public information officer of the public body	0	

Sample Website 2: Citizen Feedback Model

Website link: www.punjabmodel.gov.pk

New website

Proactive Disclosure RTI Scoresheet – Punjab	
a. Information of public body, its functions and duties	8
b. Directory of its officers and employees with their respective remuneration, perks and privileges	0
c. Budget of the public body including details of all proposed and actual expenditures	0
d. Powers and functions of its officers and employees	0
e. Description of its decision-making processes	3
f. Opportunities for the public to provide input into or be consulted about decisions	9
g. Statement of categories of information being held by the public body	0
h. Acts, Ordinances, rules, regulations, notifications, circulars and other legal instruments being enforced, issued or used by the public body	0

Proactive Disclosure RTI Scoresheet – Punjab	
i. Particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits or authorizations granted by the public body	0
j. Ease of accessibility of the information presented on self-basis	8
k. Details pertaining to filing of Information Request, Like name, designation and other particulars of the public information officer of the public body	0

Sample Website 3: Office of the Chief Minister

Website link: www.cm.punjab.gov.pk/

No changes in the content or score- site kept updated

Proactive Disclosure RTI Scoresheet – Punjab	
a. Information of public body, its functions and duties	7
b. Directory of its officers and employees with their respective remuneration, perks and privileges	3
c. Budget of the public body including details of all proposed and actual expenditures	0
d. Powers and functions of its officers and employees	2
e. Description of its decision-making processes	0
f. Opportunities for the public to provide input into or be consulted about decisions	6
g. Statement of categories of information being held by the public body	0
h. Acts, Ordinances, rules, regulations, notifications, circulars and other legal instruments being enforced, issued or used by the public body	0
i. Particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits or authorizations granted by the public body	0
j. Ease of accessibility of the information presented on self-basis	5
k. Details pertaining to filing of Information Request, Like name, designation and other particulars of the public information officer of the public body	0

Sample Website 4: Finance Department

Website link: www.finance.punjab.gov.pk

Proactive Disclosure RTI Scoresheet – Punjab	
a. Information of public body, its functions and duties	8
b. Directory of its officers and employees with their respective remuneration, perks and privileges	3
c. Budget of the public body including details of all proposed and actual expenditures	5
d. Powers and functions of its officers and employees	0
e. Description of its decision-making processes	0
f. Opportunities for the public to provide input into or be consulted about decisions	5
g. Statement of categories of information being held by the public body	
h. Acts, Ordinances, rules, regulations, notifications, circulars and other legal instruments being enforced, issued or used by the public body	10
i. Particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits or authorizations granted by the public body	0

Proactive Disclosure RTI Scoresheet – Punjab	
j. Ease of accessibility of the information presented on self-basis	5
k. Details pertaining to filing of Information Request, Like name, designation and other particulars of the public information officer of the public body	0

Sample Website 5: Punjab Revenue Authority

Website link: <https://pra.punjab.gov.pk/>

Proactive Disclosure RTI Scoresheet – Punjab	
a. Information of public body, its functions and duties	8
b. Directory of its officers and employees with their respective remuneration, perks and privileges	0
c. Budget of the public body including details of all proposed and actual expenditures	0
d. Powers and functions of its officers and employees	0
e. Description of its decision-making processes	0
f. Opportunities for the public to provide input into or be consulted about decisions	4
g. Statement of categories of information being held by the public body	0
h. Acts, Ordinances, rules, regulations, notifications, circulars and other legal instruments being enforced, issued or used by the public body	8
i. Particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits or authorizations granted by the public body	0
j. Ease of accessibility of the information presented on self-basis	5
k. Details pertaining to filing of Information Request, Like name, designation and other particulars of the public information officer of the public body	0

Sample Website 6: Excise and Taxation

Website link: www.punjab.gov.pk/excise_and_taxation

No changes in the content & score

Proactive Disclosure RTI Scoresheet – Punjab	
a. Information of public body, its functions and duties	8
b. Directory of its officers and employees with their respective remuneration, perks and privileges	0
c. Budget of the public body including details of all proposed and actual expenditures	0
d. Powers and functions of its officers and employees	0
e. Description of its decision-making processes	0
f. Opportunities for the public to provide input into or be consulted about decisions	0
g. Statement of categories of information being held by the public body	0
h. Acts, Ordinances, rules, regulations, notifications, circulars and other legal instruments being enforced, issued or used by the public body	6
i. Particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits or authorizations granted by the public body	0
j. Ease of accessibility of the information presented on self-basis	2

Proactive Disclosure RTI Scoresheet – Punjab	
k. Details pertaining to filing of Information Request, Like name, designation and other particulars of the public information officer of the public body	0

Sample Website 7: Planning and Development Department Punjab Revenue Authority

Website link: www.pndpunjab.gov.pk

Proactive Disclosure RTI Scoresheet – Punjab	
a. Information of public body, its functions and duties	9
b. Directory of its officers and employees with their respective remuneration, perks and privileges	0
c. Budget of the public body including details of all proposed and actual expenditures	5
d. Powers and functions of its officers and employees	0
e. Description of its decision-making processes	0
f. Opportunities for the public to provide input into or be consulted about decisions	4
g. Statement of categories of information being held by the public body	0
h. Acts, Ordinances, rules, regulations, notifications, circulars and other legal instruments being enforced, issued or used by the public body	7
i. Particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits or authorizations granted by the public body	0
j. Ease of accessibility of the information presented on self-basis	7
k. Details pertaining to filing of Information Request, Like name, designation and other particulars of the public information officer of the public body	0

Sample Website 8: Higher Education Department and School Education Department

Website link: www.hed.punjab.gov.pk

Site kept updated

Proactive Disclosure RTI Scoresheet – Punjab	
a. Information of public body, its functions and duties	9
b. Directory of its officers and employees with their respective remuneration, perks and privileges	3
c. Budget of the public body including details of all proposed and actual expenditures	5
d. Powers and functions of its officers and employees	2
e. Description of its decision-making processes	0
f. Opportunities for the public to provide input into or be consulted about decisions	0
g. Statement of categories of information being held by the public body	5
h. Acts, Ordinances, rules, regulations, notifications, circulars and other legal instruments being enforced, issued or used by the public body	8
i. Particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits or authorizations granted by the public body	2
j. Ease of accessibility of the information presented on self-basis	5
k. Details pertaining to filing of Information Request, Like name, designation and other particulars of the public information officer of the public body	0

Sample Website 9: Schools

Website link: www.schools.punjab.gov.pk

site kept updated

Proactive Disclosure RTI Scoresheet – Punjab	
a. Information of public body, its functions and duties	9
b. Directory of its officers and employees with their respective remuneration, perks and privileges	4
c. Budget of the public body including details of all proposed and actual expenditures	5
d. Powers and functions of its officers and employees	2
e. Description of its decision-making processes	0
f. Opportunities for the public to provide input into or be consulted about decisions	5
g. Statement of categories of information being held by the public body	5
h. Acts, Ordinances, rules, regulations, notifications, circulars and other legal instruments being enforced, issued or used by the public body	8
i. Particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits or authorizations granted by the public body	0
j. Ease of accessibility of the information presented on self-basis	6
k. Details pertaining to filing of Information Request, Like name, designation and other particulars of the public information officer of the public body	0

Sample Website 10: Zakat and Ushr

Website link: <http://www.zakat.gop.pk/>

New website design – primary content updated

Proactive Disclosure RTI Scoresheet – Punjab	
a. Information of public body, its functions and duties	6
b. Directory of its officers and employees with their respective remuneration, perks and privileges	2
c. Budget of the public body including details of all proposed and actual expenditures	7
d. Powers and functions of its officers and employees	4
e. Description of its decision-making processes	6
f. Opportunities for the public to provide input into or be consulted about decisions	3
g. Statement of categories of information being held by the public body	0
h. Acts, Ordinances, rules, regulations, notifications, circulars and other legal instruments being enforced, issued or used by the public body	7
i. Particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits or authorizations granted by the public body	2
j. Ease of accessibility of the information presented on self-basis	7
k. Details pertaining to filing of Information Request, Like name, designation and other particulars of the public information officer of the public body	0

Sample Website 11: Social Welfare and Bait-ul-Maal

Website link: http://punjab.gov.pk/social_welfare_and_bait_ul_mall

Proactive Disclosure RTI Scoresheet – Punjab	
a. Information of public body, its functions and duties	4
b. Directory of its officers and employees with their respective remuneration, perks and privileges	0
c. Budget of the public body including details of all proposed and actual expenditures	0
d. Powers and functions of its officers and employees	0
e. Description of its decision-making processes	0
f. Opportunities for the public to provide input into or be consulted about decisions	3
g. Statement of categories of information being held by the public body	0
h. Acts, Ordinances, rules, regulations, notifications, circulars and other legal instruments being enforced, issued or used by the public body	0
i. Particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits or authorizations granted by the public body	0
j. Ease of accessibility of the information presented on self-basis	3
k. Details pertaining to filing of Information Request, Like name, designation and other particulars of the public information officer of the public body	

Sample Website 12: Women Development Department

Website link: <http://wdd.punjab.gov.pk/>

No changes in the primary content – site kept updated

Proactive Disclosure RTI Scoresheet – Punjab	
a. Information of public body, its functions and duties	8
b. Directory of its officers and employees with their respective remuneration, perks and privileges	3
c. Budget of the public body including details of all proposed and actual expenditures	0
d. Powers and functions of its officers and employees	0
e. Description of its decision-making processes	0
f. Opportunities for the public to provide input into or be consulted about decisions	0
g. Statement of categories of information being held by the public body	0
h. Acts, Ordinances, rules, regulations, notifications, circulars and other legal instruments being enforced, issued or used by the public body	5
i. Particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits or authorizations granted by the public body	0
j. Ease of accessibility of the information presented on self-basis	5
k. Details pertaining to filing of Information Request, Like name, designation and other particulars of the public information officer of the public body	0

Sample Website 13: Punjab Energy Department

Website link: www.energy.punjab.gov.pk

No updates in the primary content

Proactive Disclosure RTI Scoresheet – Punjab	
a. Information of public body, its functions and duties	8
b. Directory of its officers and employees with their respective remuneration, perks and privileges	5
c. Budget of the public body including details of all proposed and actual expenditures	0
d. Powers and functions of its officers and employees	4
e. Description of its decision-making processes	0
f. Opportunities for the public to provide input into or be consulted about decisions	0
g. Statement of categories of information being held by the public body	0
h. Acts, Ordinances, rules, regulations, notifications, circulars and other legal instruments being enforced, issued or used by the public body	8
i. Particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits or authorizations granted by the public body	0
j. Ease of accessibility of the information presented on self-basis	5
k. Details pertaining to filing of Information Request, Like name, designation and other particulars of the public information officer of the public body	0

Sample Website 14: Health Department

Website link: www.health.punjab.gov.pk

No updates in the primary content – site kept updated

Proactive Disclosure RTI Scoresheet – Punjab	
a. Information of public body, its functions and duties	8
b. Directory of its officers and employees with their respective remuneration, perks and privileges	1
c. Budget of the public body including details of all proposed and actual expenditures	0
d. Powers and functions of its officers and employees	0
e. Description of its decision-making processes	0
f. Opportunities for the public to provide input into or be consulted about decisions	5
g. Statement of categories of information being held by the public body	0
h. Acts, Ordinances, rules, regulations, notifications, circulars and other legal instruments being enforced, issued or used by the public body	8
i. Particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits or authorizations granted by the public body	2
j. Ease of accessibility of the information presented on self-basis	5
k. Details pertaining to filing of Information Request, Like name, designation and other particulars of the public information officer of the public body	0

Sample Website 15: Punjab Privatization Board

Website link: www.ppb.gov.pk

No update in the content – site page found hacked (accessed July 31, 2015)

Proactive Disclosure RTI Scoresheet – Punjab	
a. Information of public body, its functions and duties	3
b. Directory of its officers and employees with their respective remuneration, perks and privileges	0
c. Budget of the public body including details of all proposed and actual expenditures	0
d. Powers and functions of its officers and employees	0
e. Description of its decision-making processes	
f. Opportunities for the public to provide input into or be consulted about decisions	7
g. Statement of categories of information being held by the public body	0
h. Acts, Ordinances, rules, regulations, notifications, circulars and other legal instruments being enforced, issued or used by the public body	5
i. Particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits or authorizations granted by the public body	0
j. Ease of accessibility of the information presented on self-basis	4
k. Details pertaining to filing of Information Request, Like name, designation and other particulars of the public information officer of the public body	0

Sample Website 16: Punjab Information Technology Board

Website link: www.pitb.gov.pk/

Site layout changed - No update in the score

Proactive Disclosure RTI Scoresheet – Punjab	
a. Information of public body, its functions and duties	9
b. Directory of its officers and employees with their respective remuneration, perks and privileges	5
c. Budget of the public body including details of all proposed and actual expenditures	3
d. Powers and functions of its officers and employees	3
e. Description of its decision-making processes	0
f. Opportunities for the public to provide input into or be consulted about decisions	5
g. Statement of categories of information being held by the public body	0
h. Acts, Ordinances, rules, regulations, notifications, circulars and other legal instruments being enforced, issued or used by the public body	2
i. Particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits or authorizations granted by the public body	0
j. Ease of accessibility of the information presented on self-basis	7
k. Details pertaining to filing of Information Request, Like name, designation and other particulars of the public information officer of the public body	0

Sample Website 17: Sports Board Punjab

Website link: www.sportsportal.punjab.gov.pk/

No major changes in the scores

Proactive Disclosure RTI Scoresheet – Punjab	
a. Information of public body, its functions and duties	8
b. Directory of its officers and employees with their respective remuneration, perks and privileges	5
c. Budget of the public body including details of all proposed and actual expenditures	0
d. Powers and functions of its officers and employees	3
e. Description of its decision-making processes	0
f. Opportunities for the public to provide input into or be consulted about decisions	4
g. Statement of categories of information being held by the public body	0
h. Acts, Ordinances, rules, regulations, notifications, circulars and other legal instruments being enforced, issued or used by the public body	2
i. Particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits or authorizations granted by the public body	0
j. Ease of accessibility of the information presented on self-basis	6
k. Details pertaining to filing of Information Request, Like name, designation and other particulars of the public information officer of the public body	0

Sample Website 18: Punjab Information Commission

Website link: www.rti.punjab.gov.pk

Proactive Disclosure RTI Scoresheet – Punjab	
a. Information of public body, its functions and duties	10
b. Directory of its officers and employees with their respective remuneration, perks and privileges	9
c. Budget of the public body including details of all proposed and actual expenditures	9
d. Powers and functions of its officers and employees	3
e. Description of its decision-making processes	5
f. Opportunities for the public to provide input into or be consulted about decisions	0
g. Statement of categories of information being held by the public body	0
h. Acts, Ordinances, rules, regulations, notifications, circulars and other legal instruments being enforced, issued or used by the public body	8
i. Particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits or authorizations granted by the public body	0
j. Ease of accessibility of the information presented on self-basis	9
k. Details pertaining to filing of Information Request, Like name, designation and other particulars of the public information officer of the public body	5 (no online mechanism – by post only)

Sample Website 19: Information and Culture

Website link: http://www.punjab.gov.pk/information_and_culture

Proactive Disclosure RTI Scoresheet – Punjab	
a. Information of public body, its functions and duties	7
b. Directory of its officers and employees with their respective remuneration, perks and privileges	0
c. Budget of the public body including details of all proposed and actual expenditures	0
d. Powers and functions of its officers and employees	0
e. Description of its decision-making processes	0
f. Opportunities for the public to provide input into or be consulted about decisions	0
g. Statement of categories of information being held by the public body	0
h. Acts, Ordinances, rules, regulations, notifications, circulars and other legal instruments being enforced, issued or used by the public body	0
i. Particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits or authorizations granted by the public body	0
j. Ease of accessibility of the information presented on self-basis	0
k. Details pertaining to filing of Information Request, Like name, designation and other particulars of the public information officer of the public body	0

Proactive Disclosure – Province of Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa

Sample Website 1: Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

Website link: www.khyberpakhtunkhwa.gov.pk

Proactive Disclosure RTI Scoresheet – KPK	
a. Information about the public body, including its organization, functions, duties, powers and any services it provides to the public	7
b. Directory of its officers and employees with their respective remuneration, perks, and privileges	3
c. Detailed budget of the public body, including proposed and actual expenditures	6
d. Powers and functions of its officers and employees	0
e. Description of its decision-making processes	3
f. Opportunities for the public to provide input into or be consulted about decisions	6
g. Categories of information being held by the public body	0
h. Acts, Ordinances, rules, regulations, notifications, circulars and other legal instruments being enforced, issued or used by the public body	6
i. Particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits or authorizations granted by the public body	0
j. Description of the manner in which requests for information may be made to the public body, including the name, title and contact details of all designated officers	3
k. Ease of accessibility of the information presented on self-basis	3

Sample Website 2: Finance Department

Website link: <http://www.financekpp.gov.pk>

Proactive Disclosure RTI Scoresheet – KPK	
a. Information about the public body, including its organization, functions, duties, powers and any services it provides to the public	8
b. Directory of its officers and employees with their respective remuneration, perks, and privileges	4
c. Detailed budget of the public body, including proposed and actual expenditures	6
d. Powers and functions of its officers and employees	3
e. Description of its decision-making processes	0
f. Opportunities for the public to provide input into or be consulted about decisions	0
g. Categories of information being held by the public body	0
h. Acts, Ordinances, rules, regulations, notifications, circulars and other legal instruments being enforced, issued or used by the public body	6
i. Particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits or authorizations granted by the public body	0
j. Description of the manner in which requests for information may be made to the public body, including the name, title and contact details of all designated officers	4
k. Ease of accessibility of the information presented on self-basis	4

Sample Website 3: Accountant General of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

Website link: <http://agkhyberpakhtunkhwa.gov.pk>

No changes in the scores

Proactive Disclosure RTI Scoresheet – KPK	
a. Information about the public body, including its organization, functions, duties, powers and any services it provides to the public	8
b. Directory of its officers and employees with their respective remuneration, perks, and privileges	6
c. Detailed budget of the public body, including proposed and actual expenditures	4
d. Powers and functions of its officers and employees	0
e. Description of its decision-making processes	0
f. Opportunities for the public to provide input into or be consulted about decisions	3
g. Categories of information being held by the public body	0
h. Acts, Ordinances, rules, regulations, notifications, circulars and other legal instruments being enforced, issued or used by the public body	3
i. Particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits or authorizations granted by the public body	0
j. Description of the manner in which requests for information may be made to the public body, including the name, title and contact details of all designated officers	3
k. Ease of accessibility of the information presented on self-basis	3

Sample Website 4: Finance and Planning Department – District Abbottabad

Website link: <http://www.abbottabad.financekpp.gov.pk>

No changes in the content

Proactive Disclosure RTI Scoresheet – KPK	
a. Information about the public body, including its organization, functions, duties, powers and any services it provides to the public	3
b. Directory of its officers and employees with their respective remuneration, perks, and privileges	3
c. Detailed budget of the public body, including proposed and actual expenditures	3
d. Powers and functions of its officers and employees	2
e. Description of its decision-making processes	0
f. Opportunities for the public to provide input into or be consulted about decisions	0
g. Categories of information being held by the public body	0
h. Acts, Ordinances, rules, regulations, notifications, circulars and other legal instruments being enforced, issued or used by the public body	0
i. Particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits or authorizations granted by the public body	0
j. Description of the manner in which requests for information may be made to the public body, including the name, title and contact details of all designated officers	2
k. Ease of accessibility of the information presented on self-basis	3

Sample Website 5: Elementary and Secondary Education Department Website

Website link: www.kpese.gov.pk

Proactive Disclosure RTI Scoresheet – KPK	
a. Information about the public body, including its organization, functions, duties, powers and any services it provides to the public	9
b. Directory of its officers and employees with their respective remuneration, perks, and privileges	3
c. Detailed budget of the public body, including proposed and actual expenditures	8
d. Powers and functions of its officers and employees	2
e. Description of its decision-making processes	4
f. Opportunities for the public to provide input into or be consulted about decisions	2
g. Categories of information being held by the public body	0
h. Acts, Ordinances, rules, regulations, notifications, circulars and other legal instruments being enforced, issued or used by the public body	4
i. Particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits or authorizations granted by the public body	0
j. Description of the manner in which requests for information may be made to the public body, including the name, title and contact details of all designated officers	3
k. Ease of accessibility of the information presented on self-basis	5

Sample Website 6: Social Welfare, Special Education & Women Empowerment Department

Website link: www.khyberpakhtunkhwa.gov.pk/Departments/SocialWelfare/index.php

Proactive Disclosure RTI Scoresheet – KPK	
a. Information about the public body, including its organization, functions, duties, powers and any services it provides to the public	8
b. Directory of its officers and employees with their respective remuneration, perks, and privileges	0
c. Detailed budget of the public body, including proposed and actual expenditures	0
d. Powers and functions of its officers and employees	0
e. Description of its decision-making processes	0
f. Opportunities for the public to provide input into or be consulted about decisions	4
g. Categories of information being held by the public body	0
h. Acts, Ordinances, rules, regulations, notifications, circulars and other legal instruments being enforced, issued or used by the public body	3
i. Particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits or authorizations granted by the public body	0
j. Description of the manner in which requests for information may be made to the public body, including the name, title and contact details of all designated officers	0
k. Ease of accessibility of the information presented on self-basis	3

Sample Website 7: Information & Public Relations Department

Website link: www.infokhyberpakhtunkhwa.gov.pk

New website layout

Proactive Disclosure RTI Scoresheet – KPK	
a. Information about the public body, including its organization, functions, duties, powers and any services it provides to the public	7
b. Directory of its officers and employees with their respective remuneration, perks, and privileges	5
c. Detailed budget of the public body, including proposed and actual expenditures	7
d. Powers and functions of its officers and employees	0
e. Description of its decision-making processes	0
f. Opportunities for the public to provide input into or be consulted about decisions	0
g. Categories of information being held by the public body	3
h. Acts, Ordinances, rules, regulations, notifications, circulars and other legal instruments being enforced, issued or used by the public body	5
i. Particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits or authorizations granted by the public body	0
j. Description of the manner in which requests for information may be made to the public body, including the name, title and contact details of all designated officers	5
k. Ease of accessibility of the information presented on self-basis	5

Sample Website 8: Police Department

Website link: <http://kppolice.gov.pk/>

No updates in the score

Proactive Disclosure RTI Scoresheet – KPK	
a. Information about the public body, including its organization, functions, duties, powers and any services it provides to the public	9
b. Directory of its officers and employees with their respective remuneration, perks, and privileges	5
c. Detailed budget of the public body, including proposed and actual expenditures	0
d. Powers and functions of its officers and employees	0
e. Description of its decision-making processes	0
f. Opportunities for the public to provide input into or be consulted about decisions	7
g. Categories of information being held by the public body	0
h. Acts, Ordinances, rules, regulations, notifications, circulars and other legal instruments being enforced, issued or used by the public body	7
i. Particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits or authorizations granted by the public body	0
j. Description of the manner in which requests for information may be made to the public body, including the name, title and contact details of all designated officers	6
k. Ease of accessibility of the information presented on self-basis	6

Sample Website 9: Health Department

Website link: www.healthkp.gov.pk

No updates in the score

Proactive Disclosure RTI Scoresheet – KPK	
a. Information about the public body, including its organization, functions, duties, powers and any services it provides to the public	8
b. Directory of its officers and employees with their respective remuneration, perks, and privileges	3
c. Detailed budget of the public body, including proposed and actual expenditures	3
d. Powers and functions of its officers and employees	4
e. Description of its decision-making processes	4
f. Opportunities for the public to provide input into or be consulted about decisions	0
g. Categories of information being held by the public body	
h. Acts, Ordinances, rules, regulations, notifications, circulars and other legal instruments being enforced, issued or used by the public body	9
i. Particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits or authorizations granted by the public body	0
j. Description of the manner in which requests for information may be made to the public body, including the name, title and contact details of all designated officers	0
k. Ease of accessibility of the information presented on self-basis	6

Sample Website 10: - Province Housing Authority

Website link: www.housingkp.gov.pk

New website layout

Proactive Disclosure RTI Scoresheet – KPK	
a. Information about the public body, including its organization, functions, duties, powers and any services it provides to the public	8
b. Directory of its officers and employees with their respective remuneration, perks, and privileges	3
c. Detailed budget of the public body, including proposed and actual expenditures	0
d. Powers and functions of its officers and employees	1
e. Description of its decision-making processes	0
f. Opportunities for the public to provide input into or be consulted about decisions	5
g. Categories of information being held by the public body	0
h. Acts, Ordinances, rules, regulations, notifications, circulars and other legal instruments being enforced, issued or used by the public body	3
i. Particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits or authorizations granted by the public body	0
j. Description of the manner in which requests for information may be made to the public body, including the name, title and contact details of all designated officers	0
k. Ease of accessibility of the information presented on self-basis	3

Sample Website 11: KPK Information Technology Board

Website link: <http://www.kpitb.gov.pk>

No changes in the score

Proactive Disclosure RTI Scoresheet – KPK	
a. Information about the public body, including its organization, functions, duties, powers and any services it provides to the public	4
b. Directory of its officers and employees with their respective remuneration, perks, and privileges	0
c. Detailed budget of the public body, including proposed and actual expenditures	0
d. Powers and functions of its officers and employees	0
e. Description of its decision-making processes	0
f. Opportunities for the public to provide input into or be consulted about decisions	2
g. Categories of information being held by the public body	0
h. Acts, Ordinances, rules, regulations, notifications, circulars and other legal instruments being enforced, issued or used by the public body	0
i. Particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits or authorizations granted by the public body	0
j. Description of the manner in which requests for information may be made to the public body, including the name, title and contact details of all designated officers	0
k. Ease of accessibility of the information presented on self-basis	4

Sample Website 12: Investment Promotion Cell

Website link: www.investinkpk.org.pk

No changes in the content

Proactive Disclosure RTI Scoresheet – KPK	
a. Information about the public body, including its organization, functions, duties, powers and any services it provides to the public	7
b. Directory of its officers and employees with their respective remuneration, perks, and privileges	0
c. Detailed budget of the public body, including proposed and actual expenditures	0
d. Powers and functions of its officers and employees	2
e. Description of its decision-making processes	0
f. Opportunities for the public to provide input into or be consulted about decisions	5
g. Categories of information being held by the public body	0
h. Acts, Ordinances, rules, regulations, notifications, circulars and other legal instruments being enforced, issued or used by the public body	3
i. Particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits or authorizations granted by the public body	0
j. Description of the manner in which requests for information may be made to the public body, including the name, title and contact details of all designated officers	0
k. Ease of accessibility of the information presented on self-basis	6

Sample Website 13: Right to Information Commission Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

Website link: <http://www.kprti.gov.pk/rti/index.php>

Proactive Disclosure RTI Scoresheet – KPK	
a. Information about the public body, including its organization, functions, duties, powers and any services it provides to the public	8
b. Directory of its officers and employees with their respective remuneration, perks, and privileges	4
c. Detailed budget of the public body, including proposed and actual expenditures	0
d. Powers and functions of its officers and employees	1
e. Description of its decision-making processes	0
f. Opportunities for the public to provide input into or be consulted about decisions	3
g. Categories of information being held by the public body	0
h. Acts, Ordinances, rules, regulations, notifications, circulars and other legal instruments being enforced, issued or used by the public body	8
i. Particulars of the recipients of concessions, permits or authorizations granted by the public body	0
j. Description of the manner in which requests for information may be made to the public body, including the name, title and contact details of all designated officers	8
k. Ease of accessibility of the information presented on self-basis	6

Recommendations:

The second year of following a large number websites of government departments of both the Punjab and the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa provinces, CRTI and Digital Rights Foundation (DRF) present following recommendations. These recommendations are solely presented with a focus to help local governments improve transparent governance by proactively sharing information with the public.

Whilst working on this research report during the first half of 2015, various loopholes were identified in both the site maintenance and the lack of useful content in the websites of public departments. However, first report of 2015 indicates some positive steps being taken by different departments as a larger number of websites were found updated with useful content. There was also quite a few websites of both the provinces that have been redesigned since the last quarterly report of 2014 was published. Redesigned websites have a better loading time and have also been designed with better user interface presenting the information to the public in a more convenient way which should be applauded.

We affirm our stand on providing support to local bodies in their efforts to be better adapted with emerging Information and Communication Technologies (ICTs). At the end, it is the government that can push these reforms and ensure conformity of various departments to various rules and regulations. Proactive disclosure is the only way forward to transparent governance and reduced corruption in the state bodies. Here is an expandable list of recommendations forwarded by CRTI and DRF; we look forward to suggestions and input from both the civil society and the government.

- According to respective RTI laws of both the provinces, government departments have to proactively share information of tenders and projects. While many websites were found updated with latest content, a majority of them lacked proper updating process with a substantial lack of budget-related information.
- It was recommended in the 2014 reports that departments should focus on user-friendly placement of content and get rid of highly confusing nested menus where most of the useful information is hidden. CRTI and DRF is happy to share that many of the website have followed this suggestion as various government websites now have a new website layout, presenting information in a very convenient way.
- A major concern of government departments unwilling to share RTI-related information still holds true as we have moved forward from 2014 to 2015. Apart from regular news and updates, with the enhancement of RTI laws, state departments should revise their web content and identify if they are even following these laws. As put in our methodology, Proactive Disclosure Research report has put forward some concrete, easy-to-follow steps to help departments identify where they are falling behind with regards to RTI laws. This year too, we see a failure of departments to upload related content but it is a great hope that like website readability, RTI-related content will also be shared more proactively in the coming months.

Brought forward from 2014 reports:

- One of the major flaws - and perhaps one with direct influence on corruption - that was discovered throughout the year of this rigorous research process was the lack of willingness showed by the government to disclose financial information. While the annual budget was

disclosed by many a websites, none of the sites researched for this report showed comprehensive details of employee remuneration, employee benefits, perks, or privileges.

- Concessions and benefits granted by the respective departments were also missing.
- Another important absence when it comes to web content was a proper list of ALL the employees and officers of the department. Only the top hierarchy holders, like the minister and directors, were shown in the sites with no thorough list of all the employees.
- For Punjab and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa RTI laws to succeed, it is important to only disclose information proactively on self-basis, but it is even more crucial to allow the citizen to demand any information. In the process of these quarterly reports, it was discovered that although almost every single website has the purported feedback button, it looked more of a window dressing than an actual functionality. Information of not only the officer responsible for getting feedback and requests of information was missing (in almost every website of both the provinces) but the contact details were also deficient. It is thus advised to keep the process of demanding information by citizen more clear by adding details of responsible officers.
- Another important recommendation based on the quarterly researches is to keep the websites more citizen-centric. The departments, for example, who had created simple polls to get feedback looked more citizen-caring than the ones who were satisfied to have the customary feedback button with no specific feedback questions / requests asked from citizens.
- Websites should start promoting their conformity with RTI laws and raise awareness in citizens by educating them about their right to information. Placement of RTI details on the homepage might help with this process of citizens' awareness.

CRTI and DRF intend to continue working on this recommendation list with the help of civil society of Pakistan and of course, the government departments of the provinces. This will not only help the departments to be better at following RTI laws but will also help citizens in getting the needed awareness to their right to demand information curbing corruption.



The Coalition on Right to Information (CRTI) was established on December 17, 2012 in Islamabad by a group of civil society organizations.

House # 370, Street # 75, E-11/3, MPCHS, Islamabad

t: +92 51 237 5158-9, 431 94 30

www.crti.org.pk